The Strategic Human Resource Transformation:
A Study on the Civil Service in Egypt

Dr. Adham ElSherbiny *

Abstract

This paper aims to shed light on the status quo of Egypt's civil service human resource ecosystem, to explore the Strategic Human Resource Transformation (SHRT) practices from different countries, and to articulate a guideline for Egypt's civil service SHRT national program to overcome the civil service challenges and bouncing towards effectiveness and sustainable HR management. To develop this paper, the desk research's approach and the comparative methodology were adopted. The results revealed that the governmental entities HR departments' practices are not coincided with the global HRM practices, and that the investments for human capital capacity building are very limited. The civil service law No.81 issued in 2016, The Central Agency for Organization and Administration (CAOA) law No. 118 issued in1964 & amendments, Egypt's vision 2030 related civil service HR projects, and the ongoing projects are not adhered and insufficient to achieve true SHRT. The current civil service HR infrastructure enabled Egypt to launch a SHRT national program that became imperative to complement Egypt's economic reform endeavors. The anchors, enablers, work streams and initiatives that constitute the program guideline were introduced.

Keywords: Human Development**,** Strategic Human Resource Transformation, Sustainable HR Management, Egypt's Civil Service, International Practices in Human Development .

ملخص

استهدفت الدراسة تسليط الضوء على الوضع الراهن لمنظومة الموارد البشرية في الخدمة المدنية في مصر، والتعرف على الممارسات الدولية في مجال التحول الاستراتيجي للموارد البشرية بالخدمة المدنية في عدة دول، وصياغة إطار عمل لبرنامج قومي للتحول الاستراتيجي للموارد البشرية في الخدمة المدنية في مصر للتغلب على التحديات التي تواجهها وتحقيق قفزة نحو الكفاءة وإدارة الموارد البشرية المستدامة. وقد تم استخدام أسلوب الدراسة المكتبية و المنهج المقارن في إعداد هذه الدراسة ، والتي أظهرت نتائجها أن ممارسات إدارات الموارد البشرية في الجهات الحكومية لا تتواكب مع الممارسات الدولية في إدارة الموارد البشرية، و أن الاستثمار في بناء قدرات راس المال البشري محدودة للغاية، وان قانون الخدمة المدنية رقم 81 لسنة 2016، وقانون الجهاز المركزي للتنظيم والإدارة رقم 118 لسنة 1964 وملحقاته، والمشاريع ذات الصلة بالموارد البشرية في الخدمة المدنية المدرجة في رؤية مصر 2030 و المشروعات التي تنفذ حاليا غير متكاملة وغير كافية لتحقيق التحول الحقيقي للموارد البشرية الاستراتيجية. كما أظهرت الدراسة أن البنية التحتية الحالية للموارد البشرية في الخدمة المدنية تُمكن مصر من إطلاق برنامج قومي للتحول الاستراتيجي للموارد البشرية والذي أصبح ضرورة ملحة لاستكمال جهود الإصلاح الاقتصادي التي قامت بها مصر، وتم تقديم المرتكزات والممكنات ومسارات الأعمال والمبادرات التي تشكل إطار عمل هذا البرنامج.

الكلمات المفتاحية: التنمية البشرية – التحول الاستراتيجي للموارد البشرية – إدارة الموارد البشرية المستدامة – الخدمة المدنية في مصر– ممارسات دولية في التنمية البشرية.

* Assistant Professor – Institute of Public Administration IPA, KSA

Introduction

In the era of the fourth industrial revolution, the governments in many countries were facing several challenges regarding technology, disruptive business environment, fiscal austerity, public increasing demand for better quality and responsive services, transparency, better governance frameworks and, lately, COVID -19 global pandemic.

In 2015, the United Nations announced its Sustainable Development Goals 2030. The civil service reform falls under the 16th goal "Peace, justice and strong institution". The relative target behind this goal is "Develop effective, accountable and transparent institutions at all levels" (SDG, 2015). The UN-world public sector report highlighted the importance of competence, professionalism, ethics, and diversity within the public service, as well as, the role of responsive and accountable public governance in achieving the UN 2030 agenda for sustainable development (UN, 2015).

The civil service's HR in any government is the corner stone to create exceptional citizen and employee experience. The future of public service HR will be shaped by the business need, joined-up approach, digitizing HR processes, talent management and new HR professional skills (Roper, 2015).

Aims of the Research

- Shed light on the status quo of Egypt's civil service HR ecosystem.
- Present HR transformation related literature review.
- Explore the Strategic Human Resource Transformation (SHRT) practices from different countries.
- Articulate a guideline for Egypt's civil service SHRT national program to overcome its challenges and to bounce towards effectiveness and sustainable HR management.

Research Problem

The New Public Management (NPM) have been recognized for some time now. The underlying intellectual approaches to civil service reform, public service modernization in general, remain largely driven and inspired by NPM ideas. The danger presented is that governments are continuing to use yesterday's tools to tackle tomorrow's challenges. A new intellectual framework or reform paradigm for guiding future changes to public administration is missed (lodge and Kalitowski, 2007). The International Labor Office (ILO) identified several challenges facing the civil service globally, including the slow pace of civil service transformation (Aeberhard, 2001). According to a McKinsey study, "70% of all transformation programs fail if you don't have enough focus and investment on the change management components of the transformation (Wordofprint, 2020). In 2014, the government of Egypt developed the administrative reform plan (Akhbarelyom, 2021), where transforming the personnel departments to HR departments was a key project under the institutional development pillar (Manshurat, 2014). However, the citizens are not satisfied with the performance and productivity of the civil service.

The research problem can be articulated as, "The personnel departments are not truly transformed to HR departments to interact as strategic business partners for the public sector organizations".

The central research question addressed by this paper is, therefore, what will Egypt's civil service HR look like by 2030? Alternatively, how are Egypt's civil service preparing for the probable future?

The desk research's approach and the comparative methodology was adopted to develop this paper. Comparative analysis means describing and explaining the similarities and differences of situations or consequences among large scale of social units such as regions, nations, societies and cultures (Miri and Shahrokh, 2019). Benchmarking also was undertaken to fulfil the purpose of this paper, it reports how well HR is doing against a standard (global, industry, or historical norm) to build on strengths or to overcome weaknesses (Ulrich, 2021)

The research is limited to the employees addressed by the civil service law and related governmental entities at the macro (i.e., central civil service HR entity) and micro (i.e., governmental entities) levels. It is also worth noticing that the terms "public sector", "civil service", and "public service" in this paper- may be used inclusively, interchangeably and spontaneously.

Importance of the Research

- It provides actionable insights for the SHRT journey to achieve paradigm-shift at the civil service ecosystem.
- Up till now, far too little attention and studies have addressed the SHRT topic, especially in the Egyptian context. This paper is thought provoking and contributing to knowledge through blended SHRT theory, practices and lessons learned from emerging and developed countries.

The research is structured into four main sections. The first section introduces Egypt's Civil Service Outlook and Ecosystem. The second section presents the literature review and the international Civil Service SHRT practices. The third section introduces the proposed guideline for Egypt' Civil Service SHRT National Program. The fourth section presents the research findings and conclusion.

1. Egypt's Civil Service Outlook

A close look to the status quo of Egypt's civil service reveals several challenges including:
- The government is the largest single employer of 5.022 million employees (CAPMAS, 2019). The number of citizens per government employee is 20, the target for 2020 was 26 and 40 for 2030 (SDS, 2016).
- Wage bill reached EGP 361 billion in FY 2021/2022, exhausting 20% of the state general budged (Ministry of Finance ,2021).
- The governmental administrative system consists of 2456 entities, including 33 ministries (Elhosary, 2019).
- Mainly seniority-based appointment of 219,657 senior employees and 11,430 senior executives (Elhosary, 2019).

- The annual training investment per employee is EGP 38.4 in FY 2018/2019 (Elhosary, 2019).
- More than 95% of the employees get "excellent" in their annual performance appraisals (Elhosary, 2018).

2. Egypt's Civil Service Ecosystem

The ecosystem of Egypt's civil service comprises from national strategies, programs, projects, organizations and laws.

2.1. Reform Strategies, Programs, and Projects

The civil service reform endeavors are led by high level strategies, programs, and projects including:
- The Sustainable Development Strategy (SDS) - Egypt's vision 2030 developed is based on the UN-SDG and initiated number of programs, contributing to the SHRT i.e. developing the human resources of public administration, improving human resource system, improving the public management system, updating the legislative structure, updating the information database of public administration, improving government services, and fighting corruption (SDS,2016).
- The economic reform program was launched late 2016. Although the exceptional conditions of COVID -19, the economy has shown resilience. Growth is expected to be 2.8 percent in FY2020/21, rising to 5.2 percent in FY2021/22 (International Monetary Fund, 2021).
- The New Administrative Capital mega project launched in 2015 to allocate all the central government institutions in one complex and absourb100.000 employees (Ministry of Housing, Utilities & Urban Communities, 2017)

2.2. Civil Service-Related Organizations

Egypt's civil service is controlled and supported by the following key national organizations:
- The Central Agency for Organization and Administration (CAOA) is the central civil service's HR administrating authority at the macro level; it's established to reform the government administration systems, achieve the goals of administrative reform, develop the civil service system, promote performance efficiency within the different units of governmental administration, and ensure justice and equality (CAOA, 2015).
- The Information and Decision Support Center (IDSC) main task is to support decision makers with regard to economic, social and political issues, while placing emphasis on priority issues to foster the reform efforts that push the development march forward. Moreover, IDSC strives to enhance relations with different ministries and government authorities, and to open communication channels with the public to measure the society's attitudes towards national issues (Devex, 2021).

- The National Institute for Governance and Sustainable Development (NIGSD) established to facilitate producers, develop regulations when dealing with state entities and affiliated agencies, and coordinate with all related entities centrally and locally; in line with good governance standards. The institute monitors and follows up Egypt national and international classification in governance, competitiveness and sustainable development. NIGSD is responsible for setting national strategy and action plan in coordination with different government of Egypt agencies (NIGSD, 2020).
- Institute of National Planning (INP) established to produce and disseminate knowledge and provide innovative solutions to policy and decision makers through conducting research, studies, enhancing capacity building and consultation services (INP, 2018)
- The National Training Academy (NTA) established in 2017 to provide multidisciplinary transformative learning and innovative solutions to cultivate effective human capital that impact society (NTA, 2021).
- The Administrative Control Authority (ACA) established with a mandate of fighting corruption at all levels of the government institutions (ACA, 2020).
- In 2017, ACA established the National Anti-Corruption Academy as an independent entity to provide outstanding knowledge, scientific, training and research services in the field of anti-corruption prevention and in other related fields (National Anti-Corruption Academy, 2022)
- The Ministry of Communications and Information Technology (MCIT) endeavors to transform the government into a digitally connected government to work efficiently and effectively, as well as promote e-governance and foster the values of transparency and accountability.
  Through "building digital Egypt", MCIT launched The Digital Capacity Building Programs for Government Employees to build the capacity of professional governmental officials and government service centers. (MCIT 2021).
- Egypt Government Excellence Award (EGEA) initiated by the Ministry of Planning and Economic Development in order to encourage the spirit of effective competition and consolidating the principles and values of excellence in all sectors of the state (EGEA,2020).

2.3. Civil Service-Related Laws

Egypt's civil service is governed by the following key laws:
- The civil service law No. 81 issued in 2016, to improve working conditions, enhance transparency of government services, and strengthening citizens' confidence in the state administration (Official Gazette, 2016).
- CAOA law No.118 issued in1964 & amendments (CAOA, 2015).
- The social insurance and pension law No.148 issued in 2019 (Official Gazette, 2019).
- The inclusive health insurance system law No. 2 issued in 2018 (Official Gazette, 2018).

3. Evolution of Human Resource Management

Human Resource Management HRM went through a historical transformation and evolved to become an indispensable academic field and an important function in the management of organizations. During the social era before the 1980s, Personnel Management (PM) focused, traditionally, on the performance of the workforce and the conditions in which this could be optimized. During the cost effectiveness era from the 1980s until the early1990s, transition from PM to Human Resource Management (HRM) occurred through adoption of technology and hard & soft HR approaches (Rotich, 2015). HRM is defined as a distinctive approach to employment management, which seeks to achieve competitive advantage through the strategic deployment of a highly committed and capable workforce using an array of culture, structural and personnel techniques (Bratton & Gold, 2017). The Strategic Human Resource Management (SHRM), emerged during the technological advancement era, is shaped by increasing forces of globalization, technological breakthroughs and pressure of increased efficiency (Rotich, 2015). SHRM is defined as "linking HRM with strategic goals and objectives of the firm to improve organizational performance and develop organizational cultures that foster innovation and flexibility" (Truss and Gratton, 1994). Thus, SHRM includes "designing and implementing a comprehensive set of proactive HR policies & practices that assure the organization's human assets contribute to the achievement of its corporate objectives" (Allui and Sahni, 2016).

4. Human Resource Transformation in Theory

In the 1990s, the concept of Human Resource Transformation (HRT) evolved and referred to the re-engineering of HR structures, processes and outcomes. HRT is defined as a "core reformation of human resource that evolves the existing organization from an administration focused segment into a mission-critical strategic component of the business - enabling success through business outcomes" (Pant, 2018). The true HR transformation is defined as "an integrated, aligned, innovative, and business focused approach to redefining how HR work is done within an organization so that it helps the organization deliver on promises made to customers, investors and other stockholders" (Navid and Ulrich ,2014). Moreover, the Strategic Human Resource Transformation SHRT is defined as a "structured sustainable approach to navigate the HRT journey towards agile HR, aligning people management and business outcomes as well as creating future value to the organization" (Elsherbiny,2020).

5. Sustainable Human Resource Management

The UN-SDGs challenge the purpose of business organizations and the purpose of HRM. Organizations need to become "more sustainable" and need to know how HRM could effectively contribute to sustainable HRM systems (Aust, *et al.*, 2020). The term "Sustainable HRM" is relatively new, while recently the field has rapidly evolved and seen as an extension of strategic HRM and presents a new approach to people management with the focus on long-term human resource development, regeneration, and renewal (Stankevičiūtė and Savanevičienė, 2018). It is defined as "The adoption of HRM strategies and practices that enable the achievement of financial, social and ecological goals, with an impact inside and outside of the organization and over a long-term horizon while controlling for unintended side

effects and negative feedback" (Ehnert *et al*., 2016). Thus, sustainable HRM is characterized by: long-term orientation, care of employees, care of environment, profitability, employee participation & social dialogue, employee development, external partnership, flexibility, compliance beyond labour regulations, employee cooperation, fairness and equality (Stankevičiūtė and Savanevičienė, 2018).Table (1) presents the types of sustainable HRM.

Table (1): The types, purpose, inputs, processes, and outputs of Sustainable HRM

Sustainable HRM types	Organizational perspective (purpose)	Sustainable HRM inputs (what key concerns?)	Sustainable HRM processes (how?)	Sustainable HRM outputs (what values, resources are created?)
1-Socially Responsible HRM	Inside-out, i.e., economic and social purpose	Creating an awareness of the impact of business on people beyond organizational boundaries and present time frames	Socially responsible HR behavior, practices, strategies, and culture, e.g., health and well-being initiatives	Economic and social values, e.g., enhanced organizational social reputation, employer attractiveness
2-Green HRM	inside-out, i.e. economic and environmental purpose	Using HRM to embed green values across an organization; implementing green workplace practices	Green HR behavior, practices, strategies, and culture, e.g. green recruitment, green awareness training, green rewards	Economic and ecological values, e.g., growing employee engagement with reduced carbon footprint
3-Triple Bottom Line HRM	Inside-out, i.e. economic, environmental and social purpose	Uses HRM competencies, skiIls, knowledge, attitudes, to create win-win-win situations	Behavior, practices, strategies, cultures etc., enabling contributions to perform HRM sustainably	Triple Bottom Line, Quadruple Bottom Line, e.g., Cross-generational (green) management, secures the transfer of knowledge and skills to future generation (economic sustainability) and enhances older workers self-esteem and well-being (social sustainability)
4-Common Good HRM	Outside-in	Uses HRM competencies, skiIls, knowledge, and attitudes to contribute to the common good and to help in solving "grand challenges"	HR practices and behavior enhancing common good values, e.g., trustful employment relationships	Social and Ecological Sustainable Development Impact, e.g., Decent working conditions in supply chains, employment creation, economic democracy

Source: (Aust, et al., 2020)

6. Human Resource Future Trends

The 2020 global human capital survey reviled the main trends in action-today-in government organizations, including: worker well-being, belonging, evolving role of HR, knowledge management, ethics and the future of work, reskilling, multi-generational workforce, workforce strategies, compensation, AI integration (Deloitte, 2020). Moreover, The Chartered Institute of Personnel Development (CIPD) conducted collaborative international research

engaged with hundreds of people professionals from different regions, sectors and specialisms. The objective of the research was to understand what trends are shaping the world of work and how these trends will influence people practices and the profession in 2030. The study identified five key trends including;
- Internal change: evolving organizational models, structures, and processes.
- Digital and technological transformation.
- Changing demographics and diversity & inclusion strategy.
- Diversifying employment relationships.
- Sustainability, purpose and responsible business (Green, *et al.*, 2020).

7. International Civil Service SHRT in Practice

Civil service's SHRT practices from eight countries explored regarding:
- The similarity of civil service culture i.e., Arab region.
- The length, maturity and results of the SHRT.
- The pioneering SHRT practices from emerging and developed countries.
- The positive and negative lessons learned.

7.1. United Arab of Emirates UAE

UAE public service HR has achieved an impressive progress in building the foundation of strong HRM governance and strategies (OCED, 2014). In 2008, the UAE's HRT journey started by establishing the Federal Authority for Government Human Resources FAHR, as the central HRM body reporting to the prime minister. UAE Government HR characterized by:
- Decentralized HR management, where the federal ministries and authorities have the control of their HR budget.
- Mixed system of a position and career- based hiring.
- Modernized legislation, systems and guides.
- Massive use of Information and Communications Technology (ICT).
- Learning and networking.
- Adoption of code of ethics and charters.

The fourth human resource strategy 2017-2021initiated to:
- Develop and implement an integrated legislative system for the management of the federal government human capital.
- Promote and develop the federal government human capital to achieve global leadership.
- Create a happy and motivating work environment for the federal government human capital.
- Ensure all administrative services adhere to the quality, efficiency and transparency standards.
- Establish a culture of innovation in the work environment and embed it as an institutional function.

Several manuals, systems and guidelines developed to support the SHRT process e.g. remote work system in the federal government , job description and evaluation policy in the federal government , HR service accelerators , HR Service Level Agreements, and happiness & wellbeing in the work place guide (FAHR, 2021).

7.2. Kingdom of Saudi Arabia KSA

In 2015, KSA's civil service HRT journey was lunched in alignment with KSA's vision 2030. The Ministry of Human Resource & Social Development is the central HR agency for KSA government, formerly it was the Ministry of Civil Service that merged with the Ministry of Labor & Social Development, (HRSD, 2020).

The SHRT in KSA was derived by King Salman Program for Human Resources Development to boost the productivity of government employees, and to improve the workplace environment. The program implemented in phases, the first one started with 8 ministers. A new organization structure for the HR general department was introduced, where the HR director directly reported to the minister (Arabia news, 2015). Several HR manuals, guidelines developed and new unified performance management system are implemented. The Institute of Public Administration (IPA) launched an interactive digital training platform & mobile application "Ethrai" to develop the skills of Saudi human capital (Ethrai, 2020). In 2019, a new civil service HR executive bylaw was issued (HRSD, 2020).

7.3. Canada

The Canadian Public Service Commission (PSC) is the central HR agency report independently to parliament. PSC is responsible for promoting and safeguarding a merit-based, representative and non-partisan public service that serves all Canadians. It also manages the tools for public service recruitment, providing applicants and managers with a single portal to access all public service job opportunities.

Pursuing continuous improvement process, Science 2012, series of blueprint 2020 is issued to address how the public service can remain both relevant and high performing. The blueprint 2020 vision is guided by four principles: 1) An open and networked environment, 2) a Whole-of-Government (WoG) approach, 3) a modern workplace, 4) a capable, confident and high-performing workforce. Social media used to engage all public servants to contribute to the long-term transformation of the public service. It has set a new benchmark in terms of how public service renewal must be structured and managed to ensure a transparent, effective and legitimate process. The blueprint 2020 introduced several lessons learned on how best to implement culture change in an organization as large as the federal public service as follows:
- Engage early, engage often, engage everyone, and make it meaningful;
- Use social media to break down barriers across levels, branches, regions, communities, and departments.
- Communicate the transformation story openly, effectively and continuously;
- Leverage the talent and support of the entire public service.
- Embody the desired change.
- Integrate engagement and continuous improvement into planning and decision-making processes. (Edwards, *et. al*, 2015).

In 2017, Canada ranked the top in the overall of the international civil service effeteness index (InCiSE, 2017) and the top in InCiSE 2019 HRM indicator (InCiSE, 2019).

7.4. Singapore

Singapore experience started from PS21 to the current Public Sector Transformation (PST) movement, emphasis has always been about keeping the Public Service relevant and agile in times of change. The PS21 movement (1995-2011) saw the public service implement a range of programs to innovate public services, improve policies and better deliver services to citizens. The PST Since 2012, focused on strengthen service delivery and citizen engagement (Singapore Government, 2019).

The organization structure and mandate of the public service division reflects the focus on public sector transformation including:

- The formation of the Public Service Transformation Group (PSTG) under the public service division to steward transformation and change from the center, ensuring alignment to WoG priorities and direction. The PSTG role is to energize, engage, and enable public sector agencies and public officers in their efforts to transform and ready themselves to build future Singapore. The PSTG partner and support senior public service leaders to drive transformation at the WoG, ministry family and individual levels.
- The establishment of the Civil Service College (CSC) in 2001as institution of learning.
- Using technology moved the public service from "no wrong door" to "just one door" which led to greater convenience, improved response time and better citizen engagement (Singapore Government, 2021).
- The initiation of four policies: comprehensive reform of the Singapore CS; anti-corruption measures; decentralization of the public service commission; and payment of competitive salaries to attract and retain the best candidates to the government (Quah, 2013).

In the next few years, transformation work will focus on:

- Improving service delivery by redesign services involving many agencies to be more customer-centric.
- Building a Digital Government as part of Singapore's vision to be a Smart Nation
- Working with citizens closely by create more opportunities to partner with citizens, businesses and non-government organizations to improve policy-making.
- Preparing every officer for the future: where every public officer will learn and reskill, and adapt to changes. Every officer will pursue innovation and be open to new ways of working. The Civil Service College has launched LEARN, a mobile platform to enable officers to learn anytime, anywhere (Singapore Government, 2019).

7.5. Ireland

Ireland's Civil Service Renewal (CSR) plan, published in October 2014, was a significant part of the overall public service reform framework and it focused on service users, efficiency, openness, transparency, accountability, leadership, renewal and organizational reform. The three-year CSR plan outlines 25 practical actions to create a more unified, professional, responsive, open and accountable civil service that can provide a world-class service to the state and the people of Ireland. Moreover, affirming the values of the CS, including the culture of accountability, efficiency and value for money (DPER, 2014). The (CSR) Plan implemented over four phases, and the 2017 progress report showed significant achievements regarding:

- The establishment of the Civil Service Management Board (CSMB).
- The introduction of annual civil service excellence and innovation awards.
- The development of a corporate governance standard for the civil service.
- The introduction of the new shared learning and development model.
- A communications and staff engagement program with staff around the country.
- Strengthening the disciplinary code.
- New staff mobility schemes.
- Holding a series of open policy debates involving stakeholders to support open approaches to policymaking (DPER, 2017).

In 2016, Ireland government commissioned the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) to assess key elements of the public service reform plan 2014-2016 on its achievements, design, governance and project management approach. OECD report indicated that the CSR Plan that was envisioned as part of the reform plan viewed as a success. One of the innovative factors of the CSR Plan was its collaborative approach. Whereby, the team for CSR Plan was composed of staff from across the government departments who had specialist skills and hosted in the DEPR, aligned with the secretaries' general acting as sponsors for specific actions, with the home departments covering the costs; this helped to ensure strong investment and greater ownership of reform.

In October 2017, the Civil Service People Strategy (CSPS) 2017 – 2020 was formally launched to set the overarching strategic HR agenda, to build strategic HR capability in the CS, to embed civil service renewal HR initiatives as key business processes, and to create a solid foundation for strengthening strategic HR capability beyond 2020.The Strategy was developed in collaboration with the HR Community (i.e. those working in HR in the CS) and senior management, under the stewardship of a Strategic HR Steering Group.

The civil service people strategy focuses on three key cross cutting strategic HR priorities shared by all departments and offices including: 1) be an employer of choice, 2) build the workforce of the future,3) build, support and value managers as people developers (DPER-CSPS, 2017).

A hallmark of the civil service renewal plan has been the recognition that delivery requires "strong collective leadership, shared ownership and sustained investment, governance and commitment". A comprehensive review of the strategy conducted to ensure that the challenges addressed and that strategic HR capability has improved across the CS (OCED. 2017). In 2017, Ireland ranked the top in HRM indicator of the international civil service effeteness index (InCiSE, 2017).

7.6. Romania

Romanian public service reform started in 2001and its most important direct contributors are the establishment of The Public Administration Reform Central Unit (CUPAR) in 2002, in order to ensure the central coordination of public administration reform. The National Institute of Administration (NIA) established to combine, organize and implement training and further education in the field of public service (Poor & Plesoianu, 2010). The National Agency of Civil Servants (NACS) established as central HR authority to co-ordinate and provide advices on HR policies across departments. As such, it is responsible for the actual management of HRM

at the central government level; designing an HR strategy; the co-ordination and supervision in the implementation of the HR policy& strategy; providing advice on the legal framework, transmitting public service values and the provision of training. Romania's first strategy for CS Development, adopted in July 2016, intended to strengthen NACS's oversight on all human resources in the administration through an informatics system that provide records on all public employees.

Romania delegates HR authority to line ministries and agencies to the same extent as the OECD average. Delegated functions include recruitment of contractual staff, duration of contract, dismissals, and flexible working conditions. Other functions shared between the central authority and individual ministries were determining the number of posts and budget allocation, pay, and post classifications, as well as the recruitment of civil servants, oversight of performance appraisal systems, and development of codes of conduct and ethics. The Strategy for Civil Service Development 2016-2020 articulated to address:

-   Clarifying roles, functions and mandates of each category of personnel in public administration (i.e., civil servants, contractual staff, political appointees and senior civil servants).
-   Introducing competency-based management and occupational standards for strategic functions and areas.
-   Recruitment reforms to increase transparency and neutrality from political interference, particularly at the highest levels.
-   Creating programs for the recruitment, training, placement and retention of young graduates in public administration, especially in areas with a shortage of personnel.
-   Reviewing performance management systems, including the indicators and criteria used.
-   Reorganizing the career system to expand beyond the three professional degrees that can be reached in only nine years so as to maintain motivation among civil servants.
-   Strengthening the role of the ethics counselor.

The strategy makes clear statements about the future requirements of the civil service including leadership, performance, being an attractive employer, skills and capabilities, integrity and ethics in the civil service and new recruitment procedures.

The strategy takes into account internal forecasting e.g., future skills shortages from retirement, workforce trends, future challenges, new skills and competences needed. It developed with broad input from the senior management community (not just HRM specialists) and endorsed at the political level (OECD, 2016).

7.7. Republic of Philippine

The SHRT journey started in 2011, when Philippine's Civil Service Commission (CSC) was challenged by the result of the organizational assessment survey conducted by the Australian Agency for International Development through the Philippines-Australia Human Resource and Organizational Development Facility (PAHRODF). The assessment revealed gaps in CSC's internal capacity to perform its role effectively as premier HR institution in the bureaucracy. CSC cooperated with PAHRODF to improve CSC's capacity and change readiness to transform steered by CSC's vision of becoming the best human resource and organization development agency in the country by 2015 and in Asia by 2030. The journey went through

four phases: 1) Awareness & Acceptance, 2) Capacity Building, 3) Action phase, 4) Sustainability. CSC journey guided by its "Four Cs of Change" framework stand for Committing to Change, Capacitating for Change, Collaborating and Contributing to Change and Celebrating and Continuing Change. The transformation fueled by six HR initiatives include:

- Performance governance system.
- Institutionalize meritocracy and excellence in HRM.
- Strategic performance management system.
- Competency-based recruitment and qualification standards.
- Competency-based learning and development.
- Leadership and coaching program (PAHRODF, 2013).

7.8. Republic of Kenya

In 1993, the government of Kenya launched the Civil Service Reform Program (CSRP) to enhance public service efficiency and productivity. Implementation was lead through a steering committee at the national, provincial, district levels and ministries with a national secretariat as its operational arm. Five broad policy areas examined under the CSRP phase I include: civil service organization, staffing levels, pay and benefits, personnel management and training, financial and performance management. There were some achievements recorded under the CSRP phase I. However, many of the activities did not contribute significantly to the improvement of wider public sector performance. This was so, because they were not anchored in a coherent strategy for reforming the role of government writ large. More or less, it was a stand-alone initiative that was not integrated with budgetary reforms.

A number of lessons learned were identified including: the need for adequate planning before implementation of any reform, training and capacity development are of vital importance, the need to adopt new information technologies for timely and accurate decision-making, the need to build acceptance of reform initiatives particularly among top managers in the service.

Building on the experience gained and lessons learned under the CSRP phase I, the government reformulated and reconfigured the CSRP, and outlined the strategies for a CSRP phase II from 1999-2002. The priority reform areas under the CSRP phase II were: 1) Staff rationalization and management of the wage bill; 2) Pay and benefits reforms; 3) Training and capacity building; 4) Performance improvement initiatives.

The World Bank rated the overall performance of both the CSRP phase I and II as unsatisfactory, due to lacked government's commitment, political backing to implementing agency, proper sequencing, planning and ownership.

In December 2002, a new government elected and announced its socio-economic blueprint in 2003, and entitled Economic Recovery Strategy ERS for wealth and employment creation. The ERS 2003-2007 announced that, "the government is committed to accelerating the public service reform to create a leaner, efficient, motivated and more productive public service that concentrates public finance and human resources on the delivery of core government services". In June 2004, the civil service reform started by:

1) Developing strategic plans for ministries & departments.

2) Developing, introducing and institutionalizing performance-based management practices.

3) Undertaking job evaluation.

4) Undertaking service delivery surveys in all ministries & departments.

5) Developing and installing service charters with clear service benchmarks and standards.

6) Developing a clear recruitment and training policy.

7) Putting all permanent secretaries and chief executives of parastatals on performance contracts.

Concerned with the slow pace of implementation of its reform initiatives, the government took a decision in September 2004 to prescribe RBM as its strategy for changing the culture of the public sector (Hope, 2012).

7.9. Analysis of the International Civil Service SHRT Practices

A close look to the International Civil Service SHRT from the emerging and developed countries revealed similarities in the following practices:

- Leading the SHRT by a single national central agency.
- Developing national strategy and programs for civil service SHRT.
- Adopting continuous improvement at all levels.
- Putting the citizen and employee at the center of the SHRT structure.
- Decentralizing and digitalizing HR management.
- Communication and synergizing cross organizations.

Benchmarking that leads to using best practices has been and will be a fundamental approach to improving human capital, but to reinvent HR, we need to build on that work and pivot to guidance. Guidance builds on benchmarking (which sets a baseline for how your organization compares to others) and best practices (highlighting which practices others have successfully used). Guidance focuses on what should be done to deliver your organization's results from human capital investments (Ulrich, 2021).

The next part will present the proposed guideline for Egypt' Civil Service SHRT National Program that structured based on benchmarking and best fit practices from the previous review.

8. The Guideline for Egypt's Civil Service SHRT National Program

The analysis of Egypt's civil service statue que, the SHRT best fit practices, UN-SDG and Egypt' vision 2030 are the key inputs to develop the guideline for Egypt' Civil Service SHRT National Program. The purpose of the guideline is to visualize what will effective and sustainable civil service HRM looks like by 2030 and beyond as well as what should be done to achieve it. The anchors, enablers, and work streams that constitute the guideline described in the following figure:

Figure (1): Anchors, Enablers, and Work Streams
Source: Developed by the author

Tables 2,3,4 presents the anchors, enablers, and work streams related initiatives and its objectives.

Table (2): The anchors and initiatives at the macro level

	Anchor	Initiative	Objective
1	Business Direction	The national SHRT Strategy	- Explore the strategic direction of the civil service and develop the SHRT strategy & business case to be aligned with global HR trends, best practices, and Egypt's sustainable development strategy. - Build on the political will to endorse the new civil service strategic HR direction.
		CAOA Transformation	- Shift the Central Agency for Organization and Administration (CAOA)'s current strategy, mandate, capabilities and culture to meet the transformation objectives. - Support CAOA to lead the SHRT program as a national champion, facilitator, enabler, supporter, regulator, monitor, knowledge hub, center of excellence and legislator for the governmental entities. - Ensure full integration, efficiency and sustainability.
		Line HR Departments Empowerment	- Strengthen the line HR departments to cope with the transformation challenges and to perform as a strategic partner for their organizations e.g., autonomy, reporting to the head of entity and HR manuals.
2	Legislation	HR Governance	- Deep-dive review and update all the outdated civil service- related laws to be aligned with HR best-fit practices and trends. - Robust good governance framework promoting HRM best Practices. - Augment the mandate of civil service council in law 81 to be able to take active role in changing the outdated strategies and polices.
		HR Compliance	- Enforce the rule of law and compliance with legal and procedural systems.

Source: developed by the author

Table (3): The cross-cutting enablers and initiatives at the macro and micro levels

	Enabler	Initiative	Objective
1	Change Management, Communication and Sustainability Mechanisms	Organismal Culture Development	- Develop and execute an operating model capable of analyzing, managing, deploying, and maintaining change to shift the employees' mind-set and organizational culture towards the desired future strategic direction. - Recommend and facilitate the application of new change interventions. - Foster a values-based culture e.g., accountability, results orientation, teamwork transparency, and commitment.
		Coordination & Sustainability Mechanism	- Formulate the SHRT coordination mechanism to lead the multi-stakeholder engagement. - Coordinate continuous community dialogs and mass and social media active participation. - Devise a mechanism to mobilize sufficient resources i.e., financial, technology, human, time, materials and partnerships to ensure the sustainability of results achieved during the course of transformation.
2	Monitoring & Evaluation (M&E)	M&E framework	- Initiate and execute M&E framework to drive decision-making, identify issues, track compliance, capitalize on experiences, adopt and adapt what has proven to be the best- fit. - Develop mechanisms for feedback, reporting and benchmarking.
		HRT Maturity	- Maximize the use of data to assess HR departments' maturity, and measure initiatives' efficiency & effectiveness. - Join the International Civil Service Effeteness Index

Source: developed by the author

Table (4): The work streams and initiatives at macro and micro levels

	Work Stream	Initiative	Objective
1	HR Infrastructure	HR Strategy and Policies	- Modernize and harmonize the HR strategy and policies to meet future needs.
		Organizational Design	- Reengineer the institutional & HR department organizational structure.
		Job Architecture	- Update the job groups, families, and descriptions according to the new organizational design.
		HR Processes	- Modify the HR processes and procedures, guidelines to be coherent, vertical & horizontal's synergized, lubricated and automated in order to deliver quality HR services.
2	Digital Transformation	Digital HR Planning	- Develop the HR digital transformation strategy and mechanism across all levels of stakeholders.
		Digital Infrastructure & Solutions	- Establish the digital infrastructure and applications e.g., Artificial Intelligence, Machine learning, block chain, mobile apps, and robotics. - Integrate HR solutions e.g., unified platform to improve on-time access to HR information and services.
3	Human Capital Capacity Development	Capacity Development Strategy	- Shift from "training" to "continuous learning & development" - Provide competency-based blended learning for cost effectiveness of building & propelling capabilities of the future HR professionals. - Embrace knowledge management to be part of the governmental entities' culture.

Work Stream	Initiative	Objective
		- Customize the global HRM practices to fit with Egypt' civil service ecosystem.
	Capacity Development Infrastructure	- Mobilize resources from key related organizations e.g., CAOA, the National Institute for Governance and Sustainable Development (NIGSD), Institute of National Planning (INP) and The National Training Academy (NTA) to establish a learning hub and digital learning platform to be hosted by the Egyptian Knowledge Bank (EKB). - Provide Training of Trainer (ToT) programs to local trainers to deliver training to all governorates.
4 Leadership Development	Senior Executive Service and Middle Management Development	- Build the capacity of the civil service's HR multi-layered leadership & managers by exposing them to best-fit HR practices and executive education programs.
	Coaching & Mentoring	- Provide coaching & mentoring opportunities to unleash the civil service HR leader's potentials.
5 Strategic Workforce Planning	Optimizing & replacing Workforce	- Design a systematic process to identify and address workforce plans that assess current resources, predict future resource needs, ensure a right mix of quality & quantity of staff, drive consistency, and consider resilient institutional structure.
	Contracting System	- Shifting to hybridize and balanced contracting system (Permanent full-time, temporary, part-time and outsourced work force).
6 Talent Management	Performance Management	- Create, execute and maintain a modern performance management system.
	Competency Frameworks	- Support the governmental entities to develop their behavioral and technical competency frameworks.
	Talent Assessment	- Commence and expand the use of the proper assessment techniques i.e., psychometric tests and assessment center.
7 Total Rewards System	Financial Rewards	- Assess, design, execute and evaluate a modern remuneration system to attract and retain talents.
	Non-Financial Recognition	- Develop and implement Non-Financial Recognition policies.
8 Retirement & Pension	Exit from work	- Simplify and automate retirement and pension procedures.
	Post-Retirement	- Transfer knowledge and experience of retired talents to new generations.
9 Public-Private Partnership	Community of Practice	- Setup the HR's community of practice including government, international, private and non-governmental organizations (NGOs), professional HR, practitioners to exchange lessons learned, cultivate a sense of cultural cohesion, and networking.
	SMEs and NGOs Business Development	- Enhance outsourcing of small & medium enterprises Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) and NGOs to serve HR business.
10 Equity, Diversity and Inclusion (EDI)	EDI Planning	- Construct and execute a framework to safeguard EDI as a cross cutting themes.
	Social Interventions	- Explore and impalement interventions to enhance EDI.
11 Employee Experience	Health & Wellbeing	- Upgrade health care services. - Facilitate wellbeing interventions.
	Green HR	- Improve fiscal workplace infrastructure (e.g., ventilation, light, equipment). - Promote the green HR practices.

Source: developed by the author

9. Conclusion

The last two decades have seen a growing trend propel towards the SHRT in the public sector to demonstrate that civil service HR, moved from compliance view of management to value-based management. The civil service SHRT can be a springboard to align HR strategy with the public sector entities' strategies and create value to HR and organization's business results.

This paper endeavored to analyze the status quo of Egypt's civil service and benchmarking the international practices in SHRT to extract lessons learned. The previous analysis emerged that the pace of Egypt's Civil service SHRT is still slower than the pace of the economic and technological changes; it has not yet caught up with the global standards and practices. Governmental entities' HR departments are in turbulent time, performing as a traditional personnel department providing traditional transactional HR functions coupled with outdated technology. Hence, it cannot interact as a reliable strategic partner for the public sector's entities. The civil service law 81 issued in 2016, CAOA law No. 118 issued in 1964 & amendments, Egypt's vision 2030 related civil service HR projects, and the ongoing projects are not adhered and insufficient to achieve true SHRT.

To achieve Egypt's vision 2030 objectives related to transparency and efficient government institutions, a national HR strategy need to be undertaken and provide clear direction regarding;1) Updating the civil service- related legislations ,2) Digital transformation,3) Human capital development ,4) CAOA transformation,5) Transparency and fighting corruption,6) Monitoring and evaluation ,7) Organizational culture and change management,8) Total rewards system.

The in-demand for employee-centric national civil service SHRT program became substantive. It needs to be envisioned as a critical complementary component to Egypt's vision 2030 and the economic reform launched in 2016. The available civil service HR infrastructure puts Egypt in an enabled position to launch this key program in the next transformative years especially post COVID -19 pandemic, which required working in radically new ways to achieve sustainable HRM and effectiveness. CAOA's proactive role is critical to shape the future of civil service HR by leading the SHRT program to achieve Egypt's vision 2030 and even beyond.

Although this paper focused on the entities governed by the civil service law, the proposed guideline is adoptable for other public and private organizations. Meanwhile, the need is emerged for future researches regarding SHRT and sustainable HR Management in the public and private sectors in the Egyptian context.

References

- ACA. 2020. Administrative Control Authority https://www.aca.gov.eg/english/About/Pages/TermsOfReference.aspx

- Aeberhard J., 2001. Comparative study of contents of civil service statutes, Document No. 5, International Labour Office, Geneva. http://unpan1.un.org/intradoc/groups/public/documents/ilo/unpan006337.pdf

- Akhbarelyom. 2021. Launching the 2nd phase of the administrative reform plan. https://m.akhbarelyom.com

- Allui, A., Sahni, J. 2016. "Strategic human resource management in higher education institutions: empirical evidence from Saudi", Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences, Vol. 235, pp. 361.

- Arabia news.2015. Human Resource Development Program. https://english.alarabiya.net/business/economy/2015/12/03/Saudi-king-approves-launching-of-HR-development-program

- Aust I. Matthewsb B. Muller-Camenb M. 2020. Common Good HRM: A paradigm shift in Sustainable HRM? Human Resource Management Review, 30, 100705. https://reader.elsevier.com/reader/sd/pii/S1053482218303917?token=2847D35F347B1D344E8151FA46EF2C35A0504D7B92A5DC724743F63848969AC0789C978B55228904226F85FE1C3B3B69

- Bratton J. Gold J.2017. Human Resource Management theory and practice. 6th ed. Palgrave and Macmillan, London, UK, 4 pp.

- CAOA. 2015. Central Agency for Organization and Administration. http://www.caoa.gov.eg/WebForms/Default.aspx

- CAPMAS. 2019. Statistical Yearbook, Issue No. 110, Ref No.71-01111-2019, Page 106. https://www.capmas.gov.eg/

- DPER. 2017. Department of Public Expenditure and Reform. Final Progress Report on the Public Service Reform Plan2014-2016. http://reformplan.per.gov.ie/2014/downloads/files/Progress%20report%202017-A4s.pdf

- DPER- CSPS. 2017. Department of Public Expenditure and Reform. People Strategy for the Civil Service 2017-2020. Ireland. https://hr.per.gov.ie/civil-service-people-strategy/

- DPER. 2014. Department of Public Expenditure and Reform. Civil Service Renewal (CSR) Plan, Ireland.https://www.gov.ie/pdf/?file=https://assets.gov.ie/4171/101218152156-e1206bb2c0964a53888531e0c96c356e.pdf#page=1

- Deloitte. 2020 .A government & public sector perspective: Human Capital Trends 2020, Key trends affecting the future of work in the public sector. https://www2.deloitte.com/us/en/pages/public-sector/articles/human-capital-trends-government-perspective.html

- Devex. 2021. Information and Decision Support Center IDSC.

- https://www.devex.com/organizations/information-and-decision-support-center-idsc-24475

- Edwards P. Fritz A. Kehoe J. 2015. Blueprint 2020: Building Tomorrow's Public Service Together, 4th Annual Canadian Association of Programs in Public Administration (CAPPA) Conference in Public Management: Public Management in Theory and Practice. http://www.glendon.yorku.ca/cappa2015/wpcontent/uploads/sites/22/Presentation-Edwards-Fritz-Kehoe-EN-final-21may.pdf

- EGEA .2020. Egypt Government Excellence Award. Ministry of Planning and Economic Development http://egea.gov.eg/en/Default.aspx

- Ehnert I., et al. 2016. Reporting on sustainability and HRM: a comparative study of sustainability reporting practices by the world's largest companies. The International Journal of Human Resource

Management, 27 (1), 88-108.

- Elhosary T. 2019. Egypt' administration structure: the concept, challenges and vision for development, The Egyptian Center for Economic Studies ECES. http://www.eces.org.eg/cms/NewsUploads/Pdf/2019_12_8-16_10_34WP%20205.pdf

- Elhosary T. 2018. Whey new civil service law for Egypt? Management today, vol. 7, pp. 35. Arab Administrative Development Organization ARADO. http://www.aradomtm.org/?page_id=360

- ElSherbiny A. 2020. Towards Strategic Human Resource Transformation In Emerging Economies' Civil Services. Egyptian Review of Development and Planning. Vol. 28 No.2. Pp.155. Institute of National Planning, Egypt. http://journal.inp.edu.eg/index.php/Ejdp/index

- Ethrai. 2020. Institute of Public Administration, KSA. https://ethrai.sa/

- FAHR. 2021. Federal Authority for Government Human Resources. UAE. https://www.fahr.gov.ae/Portal/en/about-fahr/about-fahr.aspx

- https://www.fahr.gov.ae/Portal/en/legislations-and-guides/guides.aspx

- Green M. Peters R. Young J. 2020. People Profession 2030. A collective view of future trends, CIPD. https://www.cipd.ae/knowledge/reports/people-profession-2030-future-trends

- Hope K. 2012. Managing the Public Sector in Kenya: Reform and Transformation for Improved Performance, Journal of Public Administration and Governance, Vol. 2, No. 4 http://www.macrothink.org/journal/index.php/jpag/article/view/2751

- HRSD. 2020. Ministry of Human resource and social development. KSA. https://hrsd.gov.sa

- InCiSE. 2017. International Civil Service Effectiveness Index .Blavatnik School of Government, University of Oxford. https://www.bsg.ox.ac.uk/international-civil-service-effectiveness-index

- InCiSE. 2019. International Civil Service Effectiveness Index. Blavatnik School of Government, University of Oxford.https://www.bsg.ox.ac.uk/about/partnerships/international-civil-service-effectiveness-index-2019

- INP. 2018. Institute of National Planning https://www.inp.edu.eg/Home/Index

- International Monetary Fund. 2021. Egypt: IMF Staff Concludes Mission for 2021 Article IV and Second Review for the 12-Month Stand-by Arrangement

-     https://www.imf.org/en/News/Articles/2021/05/25/pr21140-egypt-imf-staff-concludes-mission-2021-article-iv-second-review-12-month-sba

- Lodge G. Kalitowski S. (2007), Innovations in Government: International perspectives on civil service reform, Institute for Public Policy Research IPPR, UK. https://www.ippr.org/files/images/media/files/publication/2011/05/innovations_in_government_1574.pdf

- MCIT. 2021. Ministry of Communications and Information Technology. Egypt.

- https://mcit.gov.eg/en/Digital_Government

- https://mcit.gov.eg/en/Human_Capacity/MCIT/Programs_for_Government_Employees

- Manshurat. 2014. Administrative reform vision. https://manshurat.org/node/11060

- Miri. Seyed. Shahrokh. Zohreh. 2019. A Short Introduction to Comparative Research , Conference Paper, Allameh Tabataba'i ,University Faculty of Management & Accounting

- https://www.researchgate.net/publication/336278925_A_Short_Introduction_to_Comparative_Research

- Ministry of Housing, Utilities & Urban Communities. 2017. http://www.mhuc.gov.eg/Programs/Index/132

- Ministry of Finance. 2021. State General Budget. https://www.mof.gov.eg/ar/

- National Anti-Corruption Academy. (2022). https://academy.aca.gov.eg/AboutUs/Index/41#academy

- Navid N. Ulrich D.2014. Why HR Transformation Efforts Fail. Shared Services & outsourcing. Germany.https://www.iqpc.com/media/1002707/31635.pdf

- NIGSD. 2020. National Institute for Governance and Sustainable Development http://www.nmi.gov.eg/page/p/test-0101010

- NTA. 2021. National Training Academy. https://nta.eg/en/about-us/#vision

- OCED. 2017. Assessment of Ireland's second Public Service Reform Plan 2014-16. http://www.oecd.org/gov/ireland-public-sector-reform-plan-assessment.pdf

- OECD.2016. Public Governance Reviews-Romania.http://www.oecd.org/gov/publicgovernancereviews.htm

- OCED. 2014. Public Governance Review, United Arab Emirates effective and responsive institutions for sustainable development. https://www.fahr.gov.ae/Portal/Userfiles/Assets/Documents/9321781e.pdf

- Official Gazette. 2019. Vol. 33. http://www.alamiria.com/en-us/Pages/default.aspx

- Official Gazette. 2018. Vol. 2. http://www.alamiria.com/en-us/Pages/default.aspx

- Official Gazette. 2016 Vol. 43. http://www.alamiria.com/en-us/Pages/default.aspx

- Pant D. 2018. State of HR Transformation. https://www.peoplemattersglobal.com/article/infographics/state-of-hr-transformation-18570

- PAHRODF. 2013. Change Journey Storybook of CSC, The CSC's Change Management Journey.https://archive.australiaawardsphilippines.org/resource-center/publication/publication-collections/collection-of-documents-for-csc

- Poor J. Plesoianu G. 2010..Human resource management under change in the Romanian civil service in an international context, Employee Relations, Vol. 32 Issue 3 pp. 281 - 309. http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/01425451011038807

- Quah J. 2013. Ensuring good governance in Singapore: Is this experience transferable to other Asian countries? International Journal of Public Sector Management, Vol. 26 No. 5, pp. 401-420. https://doi.org/10.1108/IJPSM-05-2013-0069

- Roper J. 2015. The future of public sector HR, hrmagazine. http://www.hrmagazine.co.uk/article-details/the-future-of-public-sector-hr

- Rotich K. 2015. History, Evolution and Development of Human Resource Management: A Contemporary Perspective, Global Journal of Human Resource Management Vol.3, No.3. https://www.academia.edu/19974912/History_Evolution_and_Development_of_Human_Resource_Management_A_Contemporary_Perspective

- Stankevičiūtė Ž. Savanevičienė A. 2018. Designing Sustainable HRM: The Core Characteristics of Emerging Field, Sustainability, 10, 4798. https://www.mdpi.com/2071-1050/10/12/4798

- SDG. 2015. Sustainable Development Goals http://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/development-agenda & https://www.enow.gov.eg/Report/Vision-Ar.pdf

- SDS. 2016. Sustainable Development Strategy. Egypt vision 2030. https://www.arabdevelopmentportal.com/sites/default/files/publication/sds_egypt_vision_2030.pdf

- Singapore Government. Public Service Division. Prime minister's office. (2019).Transforming the Public Service to Build Our Future Singapore, From PS21 to Public Sector Transformation (PST). https://www.psd.gov.sg/what-we-do/transforming-the-public-service-to-build-our-future-singapore

- Singapore Government. Public Service Division. (2021). our organization structure.

https://www.psd.gov.sg/who-we-are/our-organisational-structure

- Truss C. Gratton L. 1994. Strategic Human Resource Management: a conceptual approach. International Journal of Human Resource Management Vol. 5(3). pp. 663- 686.

- Ulrich, Dave. 2021. Moving from benchmarking and best practices to guidance HRD connect.

- https://www.hrdconnect.com/2021/01/12/moving-from-benchmarking-and-best-practices-to-guidance/

- UN. 2015. World Public Sector Report, Responsive and Accountable Public Governance, Department of Economic and Social Affairs. https://www.un.org/development/desa/publications/2015-world-public-sector-report.html

- http://www.eajournals.org/wp-content/uploads/Human-Resource-Management-and-Public-Organizations.pdf

- Wordofprint.2020. Change Management approach for strategic HR transformation programs. https://www.wordofprint.com/2020/07/change-management-approach-for.html